

THE EASTERN BUDDHIST

equivalents in the index as required is also a welcome addition as it affords the reader the benefit of knowing Professor Nagao's judgement on the appropriateness, or lack thereof, the renderings found in the Tibetan and Chinese translations. In this sense, this index is far more than a mere trilingual glossary.

Although there should be no need to describe the influence of this text upon the Mahāyāna tradition, for students somewhat new to Buddhist Studies, it is probably worth mentioning that this work of Asanga had far-reaching influence in India, China and Tibet. The Paramārtha translation into Chinese, for example, became the basis of a school of Yogācāra Buddhism known by the same title as the translation, the She-lun tsung 攝論宗. But in addition to its discussion of such important Yogācāra themes as the three natures, the three bodies of the Buddha and the *ālayavijñāna*, the *Samgraha*, true to its name, is indeed a compendium of core themes that make up the Mahāyāna creed. The principal work of the Fa-hsiang/Hossō 法相 school, the *Ch'eng wei shih lun* 成唯識論, also owes a great deal to Hsüan-tsang's translation of this work. The value of this index to students of Indian and Tibetan Yogācāra goes without saying, but studies of Yogācāra Buddhism in East Asia will also benefit greatly from this work, particularly when the Chinese-Sanskrit volume becomes available.

MARK L. BLUM

THE MANUSCRIPTS OF NANATSU-DERA: A Recently Discovered Treasure-House in Downtown Nagoya. By Ochiai Toshinori, with related remarks by Makita Tairyō and Antonino Forte. Translated and edited by Silvio Vita. Kyoto: Italian School of East Asian Studies (Occasional Papers Series no. 3), 1991. pp. xii + 102 with illustrations. ¥2,500.

Every now and then, a long-lost Buddhist scripture comes to light in Japan. The manuscript collections of temples shelter a rich variety of texts, from fragments to canons. Most of the temple collections are in Kyoto or Nara. Or so we assume. Perhaps the most important revelation of *The Manuscripts of Nanatsu-dera* is that places outside of the Kyoto/Nara area may conceal treasures—Nagoya, for example. This book introduces us to a collection of hand-copied scriptures that belongs to Nanatsu-dera in Nagoya.

BOOK REVIEWS

Nanatsu-dera 七寺 is a Shingon temple, said to have been founded by Gyōki 行基 in 735. Most of the temple buildings were destroyed during an air raid in March 1945. The manuscripts, however, had been evacuated to the countryside and thus escaped destruction.

The Nanatsu-dera texts were not unknown. They were not dug up from the ground, extracted from a Buddhist statue, or discovered behind a sealed door. It might be better to think of the Nanatsu-dera scriptures as having been hidden in plain sight. The manuscripts had never been forgotten during their eight hundred years, but they had not been fully appreciated.

The manuscripts, a total of 1,162 works, were copied between 1175 and 1180 (late Heian) and were stored in thirty-one lacquered wood chests dating from the Heian period. In 1900, the Nanatsu-dera canon was designated a National Treasure (later changed to the lower rank of Important Cultural Property), yet scholars of Buddhism did not pay much attention to the manuscripts. Rather, the scriptures were studied by art historians and calligraphy experts, who appreciated their beauty. A catalogue of the Nanatsu-dera manuscripts was published in 1968, but this still did not spark the interest of Buddhologists.

The Manuscript of Nanatsu-dera is composed of three sections, each by a different scholar. "A Report on the Newly Found Texts of Nanatsu-dera" by Ochiai Toshinori (pp. 5-48) is the heart of the book. Ochiai, a professor at Kachō College in Kyoto, gives a list of fifteen newly discovered texts. The "newly discovered" aspect varies from text to text. In some cases, the text is truly new: a previously unknown title and new content. In most cases, the title of the Nanatsu-dera sūtra was known from catalogues or other sources, but no copy of the sutra was extant. Some of the manuscripts are variant versions of extant scriptures.

For each entry, Ochiai gives a complete scholarly account of the history and importance of the text: what early Chinese and Japanese catalogues said about the text; a summary of the research on the text (since the research is usually in Japanese, this is particularly useful for Western scholars); an evaluation of the religious and historical significance; a summary of the scripture or a presentation of important parts.

For the benefit of readers who might have difficulty obtaining the book and especially for readers who are eager to know whether any of the fifteen manuscripts is crucial for their work, I give below Ochiai's list. I borrow Vita's English translations of the titles but omit the "spoken by the Buddha" (*foshuo* 佛說) included in many of the titles.

1. *Benxing liu polomi jing* 本行六波羅蜜經 (Scripture of the Previous Practices of the Six *Pāramitā*). 1 chuan.

THE EASTERN BUDDHIST

2. *Du fanzhi jing* 度梵志經 (Scripture on the Salvation of the *Brāhmana*). 1 chuan.

3. *Foshuo touta jing* 佛說頭陀經 (Scripture of *Dhūta* [Practice]). 1 chuan.

4. *Foshuo Piluo sanmei jing* 佛說毘羅三昧經 (Scripture of *Piluo Samādhi*). 2 chuan. Ochiai presents eight pages of discussion, including translations of some passages.

5. *Foshuo qingjing faxing jing* 佛說清淨法行經 (Scripture on the Practice of the Pure Law). 1 chuan.

6. *Foshuo anmu jing* 佛說安墓經 (Scripture for the Protection of Graves). 1 chuan.

7. *Foshuo zhaohun jing* 佛說招魂經 (Scripture for the Recalling of the Soul). 1 chuan.

8. *Foshuo bi'an shenzhou chengjiu jing* 佛說彼岸神呪成就經 (Scripture of the Accomplishing of Magical Spells for [Reaching] the Other Shore). 1 chuan. The name of this text does not appear in any other catalogue. It is especially interesting because *higan* (彼岸) rites and ceremonies are so important in Japan.

9. *Foshuo dayuan gongde liuzhai jing* 佛說大願功德六齋經 (Scripture on the Six [Days] of Abstinence and the Merits of the Great Vow), 1 chuan. All 235 characters of the sūtra are published here, without translation.

10. *Foshuo liuxing dao jing* 佛說流行道經 (Scripture for the Spreading of the Way). 1 chuan.

11. *Jingdu jing* 淨度經 (Scripture of Jingdu). Second chuan.

12. *Dasheng Pishamen gongde jing* 大乘毘沙門功德經 (Scripture of the Great Vehicle on the Merits of *Vaiśravaṇa*). Second, third and fourth chuan.

13. *Foshuo foming jing* 佛說佛名經 (Scripture of the Names of the Buddha). 16 chuan.

14. *Dasheng pusa rudao sanzong guan* 大乘菩薩入道三種觀 (Three Kinds of Contemplation for the Entering of the Way of the Great Vehicle Bodhisattva). 1 chuan. Ochiai provides a five-page discussion of this work attributed to Kumārajīva, which had been considered lost. He includes a summary of its content. The Nanatsu-dera manuscript is approximately 8,600 characters long (which would translate to something less than six pages in the Taishō canon format). Some scholars of Chinese Buddhist thought may consider this text the most exciting find.

15. *Ko shōgyō mokuroku* 古聖教目錄 (Old Catalogue of Holy Teachings). 1 kan. This is a Japanese catalogue of a temple collection, listing 1,247 titles in sixteen categories (Kegon, Hokke, Nehan, etc.).

Ochiai identified the above fifteen texts as the most significant discoveries based on preliminary surveys. There is more at Nanatsu-dera, and further investigation may uncover texts of comparable interest (for a mention of some

BOOK REVIEWS

other Nanatsu-dera scriptures, see Jamie Hubbard, "A Report on Newly Discovered Buddhist Texts at Nanatsu-dera," *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies* 1991, 18-4, pp. 401-406).

The second section of the book (pp. 49-53), called "General Evaluation of the Nanatsu-dera Manuscripts," is the edited transcript of an interview with Makita Tairyō, one of the greatest living scholars of Buddhism, known especially for his *Gikyō no kenkyū* 異経の研究 (Studies on Apocryphal Scriptures). As Makita rightly comments, the Nanatsu-dera canon will cause people to reconsider their Kyoto-centric view of Japanese Buddhism.

The third section of the book is Antonino Forte's "My First Visit to Nanatsu-dera: Impromptu Notes and Impressions" (pp. 55-77). Readers should turn to this section first; they will get a clear idea of the importance and history of the Nanatsu-dera canon. In a diary-like style, Forte describes his June 1990 trip to Nanatsu-dera (with Makita, Ochiai, and others). Along with talk of trains and tea, Forte communicates the joy of discovery. Forte and his colleagues examined the 16-chuan *Sūtra on the Names of the Buddhas*. Thirty-chuan versions of the sūtra exist, but it was the 16-chuan version that was used in the Butsumyō-e (ceremony of the Buddhas' names) held at the court and mentioned by Sei Shōnagon in her *Pillow Book*. Thus, the Nanatsu-dera manuscript is more historically significant than the other versions.

Silvio Vita has produced a smooth English translation from Japanese and Italian, and readers will be grateful that he has also tackled the task of translating some of the Chinese passages discussed by Ochiai. The book has an excellent index, and *kanji* are generously supplied wherever readers could want them.

Most of the discussion in the book focuses on textual transmission, textual variants, and so forth, and is quite specialized. Other sorts of questions (e.g., the social historical setting of the sūtra-copying enterprise, the composition of the canon, China/Japan relations, etc.) must necessarily wait until all the manuscripts have been evaluated. Ochiai himself hints at an interesting issue when he writes that "the syncretic cult of *kami* and Buddhas centered on Owari's Atsuta Shrine and the manuscript copying at the Nanatsu-dera are connected to a considerable extent" (p. 48), but he does not provide any further information.

One scholar of Buddhism, who shall remain nameless, remarked to me that he could not see what was so significant about the Nanatsu-dera manuscripts. Significance, like much else, is in the eye of the beholder. All of the scriptures are short, and most of them, except for No. 14 by Kumārajīva, are practice-oriented. Most students of Buddhism may not find anything of immediate relevance in the Nanatsu-dera materials, but they will certainly want to know about the collection. It is exciting to realize that discoveries can still be made,

THE EASTERN BUDDHIST

that revelations (of a very tangible sort) may lie in store for us. Furthermore, as Makita says, the recognition of the importance of the Nanatsu-dera manuscripts may prompt us to emend our conceptions of the history of Buddhism in Japan.

Forte compares the Nanatsu-dera manuscripts to the Tun-huang documents (Makita seems to demur). It may well be, as Forte states, that the Nanatsu-dera discovery yields the greatest cache of new documents since the Tun-huang caves were visited by Western explorers. But this is just to say that there has been no large-scale finding of any sort since Tun-huang. In a way, the limits of the Nanatsu-dera collection highlight the peerlessness of the Tun-huang materials. The comparison to Tun-huang should be taken as an understandable exaggeration, uttered in the flushed excitement of discovery.

The Manuscripts of Nanatsu-dera is distributed through Otto Harrassowitz (Wiesbaden, Germany) and through Hōyū shoten and Tōhō shoten in Kyoto.

ELIZABETH KENNEY