The Way of Introspection: Kiyozawa Manshi's Methodology

YASUTOMI SHIN'YA

I. Kiyozawa's Turn Towards Introspection

K IYOZAWA Manshi is known as the leader of a Buddhist movement called Spiritual Activism (Seishin-shugi 精神主義). In describing the movement, Kiyozawa called it activism (jikkō-shugi 実行主義), subjectivism (shukan-shugi 主観主義), and the way of introspection (naikan-shugi 内観主義). Among these three, it is "introspection" that describes the specific method of practice employed in Spiritual Activism. Tada Kanae, one of Kiyozawa's leading disciples, describes Spiritual Activism as follows:

Spiritual Activism, which my master, Kiyozawa, advocated, is a practical path of self-cultivation for gaining liberation from anguish and suffering. Its aim is to lead each individual to spiritual contentment and freedom. . . . As the method for achieving this goal, Spiritual Activism employs introspection. ¹

Kiyozawa encountered many difficulties and disappointments in his life, but he used these various experiences as opportunities to reflect deeply within himself. Introspection, however, did not play a significant role in his early writings. For example, in *Shūkyō tetsugaku gaikotsu* 宗教哲学骸骨 (Skeleton of a Philosophy of Religion), which he published in 1892 at the age of thirty, Kiyozawa, under the influence of Spencer and Darwin, focused on the

¹ Tada 1991, p. 163.

notion of evolution to develop a theory of human progress. In this work, Kiyozawa focuses, not on the notion of introspection, but on "self-awareness" (jikaku 自覚), his understanding of which is set forth in the third chapter entitled "Reikonron 霊魂論 (The Theory of the Soul)." Here, Kiyozawa rejects both the theories that the soul has form and that it is formless, and presents his own view, which is that the soul is none other than self-awareness. In the English translation of Shūkyō tetsugaku gaikotsu, he states, "the Soul is the apperceiving Substance." All humans are characterized by the workings of the spirit, and possess the faculty for perceiving the myriad different objects in the world. "Soul" is the term which Kiyozawa uses to refer to the perceiving subject. However, Kiyozawa later comes to realize that, "The existence or non-existence of hell and the Pure Land as well as the question of whether the soul is immortal or not, are both matters which are useless to argue over."3 Henceforth, he never brought up the notion of the soul in his writings again. It may be noted in passing that the phrase "actual introspection (naikan jissai 内観実際)" is found in his Tariki-mon tetsugaku gaikotsu shikō 他力門哲学骸骨試稿 (Draft of a Skeleton of a Philosophy of the Gate of the Other Power), compiled in 1895. However, no special significance is attached to this term here.

In 1897, Kiyozawa was frustrated in his attempts to reform the Otani-ha and was forced to resign from the priesthood. Moreover, his experiment in extreme asceticism came to an abrupt end when he contracted tuberculosis in 1894. In such trying times, Tada states, "My master (Kiyozawa) became an introspective and self-reflective person." In other words, he turned his gaze away from the external problems of the denomination in order to focus on the problems internal to his own individual self. Concerning this change, Kiyozawa later recalled:

From the end of 1898 to the beginning of 1899, I read the four $\bar{A}gamas$. In April of 1898, the (reform) movement came to an end with the decision to discontinue $Ky\bar{o}kai$ jigen 教界時言 (Timely Words for the Religious World), the magazine published by the reform movement. Upon returning to my temple, I found time to

² KMZ, vol. 1, p. 133.

 $^{^3}$ This is found at the end of the entries for 1901 in his $T\bar{o}y\bar{o}$ nikki 当用日記 (Diary). See KMZ, vol. 8, p. 436.

⁴ Section 12, "Shinrei 心霊 (Soul)." KMZ, vol. 2, p. 56.

⁵ Tada 1991, p. 162.

rest, and fortunately gained the chance to reflect inwardly on myself at length.⁶

The "inward reflection," which Kiyozawa refers to in the quotation above, led to a transformation of his inner life. Subsequently, the terms "introspection" and "self-reflection" come to appear with increasing frequency in his writings. From this fact, we can see that these two concepts had become the central concerns of his spiritual life. As noted in the quotation above, around this time Kiyozawa also began to study the Agamas, which had long been slighted by Japanese Buddhists as a Hinayana text, to learn both about Śākyamuni's understanding of human existence and the Buddhist spirit of self-renunciation and self-cultivation. At the same time, Kiyozawa discovered the writings of Epictetus, a Stoic philosopher who was a slave in the Roman Empire. As Kiyozawa later recalled, "from autumn till winter 1898, I read Epictetus' Discourses, and felt I learned a lot from it." Epictetus, who preached the attainment of inner freedom through self-reflection and ascetic practices, asserted that freedom and mental equilibrium could be achieved by maintaining an attitude of disinterestedness towards things which are beyond one's ability to control, namely, wealth, fame, social position and death. Though Epictetus had never stated that the negation of the self was the ultimate goal of self-reflection, under his influence, Kiyozawa was led to the world of religion, which can only be entered through the negation of the self. His quest ultimately led to the discovery of the Tannisho, which reveals the quintessence of his Other Power faith.

For Kiyozawa, introspection means self-examination. It is not meant to culminate in a state of other-worldly bliss, in which the self is totally forgotten. Instead, it refers to a way of reflecting inwardly on oneself in order to realize that one is a deluded finite being, laden with raging blind passions. This contrasts sharply with the approach to self-examination in which one's self is not made the object of careful investigation or criticism. Yet neither does self-examination refer to the process whereby the self is analyzed theoretically. As Kiyozawa states, "To examine the self through the process of self-cultivation means to examine how one is actually acting. To do this is none other than introspection."

⁶ Tōyō nikki, entry for March 26, 1901. KMZ, vol. 8, p. 441.

⁷ Ibid., p. 441

⁸ From the essay "Shinrei no shūyō 心霊の修養 (The Cultivation of the Spirit)," KMZ, vol. 7, p. 210.

Kiyozawa spent the latter part of his life agonizing over his incurable tuber-culosis and struggled with the anxiety, suffering and unease which arose ceaselessly in him as a result. However, rather than distracting himself from his feelings, he confronted them without fleeing from them. By probing deeply into these feelings, he sought to gain insight into the reality of human life. Such insight arises from a deep spiritual longing which can be best described as, to use Kiyozawa's words, "the most active desire which arises from the deepest part of the human heart." It is when we are prompted by such deep spiritual longing that we can truly engage in introspection. Moreover, through such spiritually committed introspection, we discover in ourselves a stable and immutable ground of being, which enables us to lead our lives as "practitioners of adamantine minds" or "the true disciples of the Buddha." Sākyamuni, revered by Kiyozawa, was not only a person who deeply understood the reality of human suffering, but was also a teacher who lived with an indomitable aspiration for enlightenment. Kiyozawa says:

The reason why I was moved so deeply upon reading the *Agamas* was because I was lying sick in bed, frequently coughing up blood. Therefore you should know that, in order to savor the sublime essence of the Buddhist teachings, it is most important to see yourself standing at the extreme where life turns to death.¹¹

"To see yourself standing at the extreme point where life turns to death" means to confront death honestly, reflect upon oneself without self-deception, and finally effect a thoroughgoing transformation through which one can resolutely accept oneself as one is. In other words, the goal of introspection is to discover, by gazing intently and relentlessly upon oneself, that the Buddhist path provides a stable and immutable ground of being, which enables us to live as true disciples of the Buddha. From the time when the Buddha preached the Four Noble Truths, introspection became recognized as a practical method for attaining liberation from the cycle of birth-and-death. In this sense, it can be said that Kiyozawa recovered the traditional Buddhist path through his reading of the $\bar{A}gamas$.

⁹ "Notes for a Lecture before the Future Abbot (*Goshinkō oboegaki* 御進講覚書)," KMZ, vol. 7, p. 188.

¹⁰ These terms are found in Shinran's *Kyōgyōshinshō*. See CWS, vol. 1, p. 117, slightly amended.

^{11 &}quot;Records on Overturning Delusions and Attaining Enlightenment (*Tenmei kaigo roku* 転送開悟録)," KMZ, vol. 2, p. 187.

II. Introspection and Examination of the Self

In 1898, when he was thirty-six years old, Kiyozawa began to keep a diary called *Rōsenki* 臘扇記 (December Fan). Defeated in the struggle to reform the Ōtani-ha and suffering from debilitating tuberculosis, the title shows how Kiyozawa saw himself at this time: as useless as a fan in December. But belying its title, the diary recounts his heroic efforts to realize his true self in spite of the realization that he was totally worthless. Epictetus' *Discourses* was an important source of inspiration at this time. Although as a slave he was not in full control of his life, this ancient Roman philosopher lived in a state of complete spiritual freedom. Starting from Epictetus' distinction between what is controllable and uncontrollable in life, Kiyozawa developed his thoughts in terms of his understanding of Other Power faith:

- · Daily I encounter things that I cannot control
- If I wish for things to follow my will, I must understand my limits
- It is for this reason that the desire to examine the self arises
- · The result of self-examination is the desire to do good
- The desire to do good leads to Other Power faith
- · Other Power faith develops into gratitude
- Gratitude (recitation of the Name in praise) becomes the desire to attain faith and teach others to have faith
- The desire to attain faith and teach others to have faith leads to the desire to practice and teach others
- And the desire to practice and teach others comes back once again to the desire to do good and so on

These are linked together as a circle. 12

Here, Kiyozawa states that introspection develops in a circular fashion, beginning with the examination of one's limits, moving to the cultivation of morality, then to the desire to attain faith for oneself, and ultimately, returning once again to the desire to cultivate morality. Hence, introspection for Kiyozawa was never a passive self-centered act that alienates a person from his surroundings. Rather, it was a dynamic action, which serves to open oneself up to others.

The reason why the desire to do good became a central component in the process of introspection was not unrelated to the numerous discouraging

¹² Rōsenki, entry for October 26, 1898. KMZ, vol. 8, pp. 367-68.

events in Kiyozawa's life, including the failure of his reform movement, his banishment from the priesthood by the Ōtani-ha as punishment for his activities, his tuberculosis and, as a result, his inability to fulfill his priestly duties as an adopted son of Saihō-ji 西方寺. Kiyozawa later wrote, "When we strive at introspection and seek for the firm ground of our being, the first thing we are confronted with is the fact that we are deeply deluded and utterly incapable of doing anything at all, that is to say, that we are foolish beings of karmic evil caught in birth-and-death." These words, which describe his profound sense of repentance, are also Kiyozawa's way of expressing the notion of the "two kinds of deep faith," which is central to the Shin Buddhist formulation of faith. According to this formulation, faith consists of two aspects: (1) the realization that one is a totally evil person incapable of doing anything to gain liberation, and (2) the realization that such an evil person is the very object of Amida Buddha's compassionate activity to save all beings by leading them to the Pure Land. In the Kyōgyōshinshō, Shinran expresses this as follows:

Deep mind is the deeply entrusting mind. There are two aspects. One is to believe deeply and decidedly that you are a foolish being of karmic evil caught in birth-and-death, ever sinking and ever wandering in transmigration from innumerable kalpas in the past, with never a condition that would lead to emancipation. The second is to believe deeply and decidedly that Amida Buddha's Forty-eight Vows grasp sentient beings, and that allowing yourself to be carried by the power of the Vow without any doubt or apprehension, you will attain birth.¹⁴

Through keen introspection, Kiyozawa realized that he was a deeply deluded person (the first of the two kinds of deep faith described above), and discovered an authentic grounding in Other Power faith (the second type above). He explains:

How should one engage in self-cultivation? I say: you should reflect on your self. Reflect on your self and apprehend the Way of Heaven. Once you apprehend the Way of Heaven, you will not feel there is anything lacking in the things you have. Once you feel there is nothing lacking in the things you have, you will not desire things that other people have. If you do not desire things that other people have,

^{13 &}quot;Seishin-shugi 精神主義 (Spiritual Activism) no. 2," KMZ, vol. 6, p. 303.

¹⁴ CWS, vol. 1, p. 85.

there will be no conflict with other people. Feel satisfied with yourself; do not desire, do not be involved in conflicts. Nothing in the world is stronger than this or as all-embracing as this.¹⁵

In this passage, self-cultivation is said to consist of a mutual interaction between self-reflection and the apprehension of the Way of Heaven, which is fundamentally similar to the structure of the "two kinds of deep faith," and allows those who practice self-cultivation to open themselves up spiritually. Our daily lives are characterized by discontent and dissatisfaction, but our experience of discontent can provide us with an opportunity to embark upon self-cultivation and apprehend the Way of Heaven. As a result, we can achieve spiritual satisfaction and have a rich and creative life as free and independent human beings. Through the practice of introspection, Kiyozawa was able to gain the firm belief that, no matter what kind of situation he found himself in, he could achieve unconditional spiritual contentment.

III. Introspection as a Way of Religious Practice

During Kiyozawa's lifetime, Japan pursued a relentless policy of modernization under the slogan of "rich nation and strong army" in order to catch up with the Western powers and gain recognition as a modern country. The rapid and massive program of westernization and industrialization, however, created a host of social problems, leading to a widespread sense of anxiety and alienation, particularly among the young. In response to this situation, new movements appeared among Japanese Buddhists.

In 1900, the year after Kiyozawa arrived in Tokyo to become the president of the newly-created Shinshū University, the Association of Buddhist Puritans (*Bukkyō Seito Dōshikai* 仏教清徒同志会) began publication of a magazine called *Shin Bukkyō* 新仏教 (New Buddhism). The "New Buddhist Movement," which took its name from this magazine, sought to reform society on the basis of Buddhist faith. Its platform consisted of six articles, including the following:

- (1) Our fundamental standpoint is a sound Buddhist faith.
- (2) We will work for the fundamental reform of society by advancing and spreading sound faith, knowledge and justice. ¹⁶

This movement was one of the most influential Buddhist movements of the

¹⁵ Rōsenki, entry for February 25, 1899. KMZ, vol. 8, p. 423.

^{16 &}quot;Bukkyō seito dōshikai kōryō 仏教清徒同志会網領 (Outline of the Association of Buddhist Puritans)," published in the first issue of *Shin Bukkyō*. See Futaba, Fukushima and Akamatsu eds. 1978, vol. 1, p. 6.

mid-Meiji period. By calling for Buddhists to work for the improvement of society, it was activist in nature, similar to present-day "engaged Buddhism." Interestingly, in one of the issues of *Shin Bukkyō*, Kiyozawa published an article entitled "Naikan-shugi 内観主義 (The Way of Introspection)" in which he criticized the materialistic and progressive view of human existence, and argued for the necessity of engaging in introspection as a means for retrieving the dignity of humanity. He states:

There are the subject and the object. It is not easy to determine whether the subject creates the object, or vice versa. However, in a practical sense, it is possible to make both the subject and the object primary. The practical method of making the subject primary is called "the way of introspection." ¹⁷

It must be noted here that Kiyozawa did not simply stress the practical efficacy of introspection, but rather saw it as a principle or systematic method. Therefore, his position contrasted sharply with that of the members of the New Buddhist Movement, who attempted to solve social problems through active engagement within society. Unlike them, Kiyozawa advocated a paradoxical position, one which asserted that the problems of everyday life can only be resolved by first effecting a thorough transformation of one's mind through introspection and self-reflection. In another article entitled "Seikatsu mondai 生活問題 (Problems of Daily Life)," he argued that the position represented by the Association of Buddhist Puritans should be called an objective approach to problem solving, while the position employing introspection and self-reflection should be seen as a subjective way. After making this point, he then continues, "Suppose there are people who wish to gain insight into the fundamentally deluded nature of everyday life. Once they realize that it is no longer possible to rely on the objective approach to solve problems, they necessarily come to rely on the subjective approach."18 This statement led Katō Genchi 加藤玄智, one of the leaders of the New Buddhist Movement, to criticize Kiyozawa and his "way of introspection" in an article called "Jōshiki-shugi to seishin-shugi 常識主義と精神主義 (Common Sense and Spiritual Activism)" published in *Shin Bukkyō* (vol. 2, no. 3). Katō's position is clearly stated in the following line, "I am critical of Spiritual Activism (or the way of introspection), in which the subjective spirit is allowed to swal-

¹⁷ Futaba, Fukushima and Akamatsu eds. 1978, vol. 1, p. 175.

¹⁸ KMZ, vol. 6, p. 117.

low up everything existing objectively outside oneself." However, because it is presented from the standpoint of common sense, Katō's criticism remains far removed from the standpoint of religion, which is concerned with the inner spiritual life of human beings.

Kiyozawa gave the name "Spiritual Activism" to his approach towards Buddhism and in January of 1901 started the journal Seishinkai 精神界 (Spiritual World) to set forth his views. The magazine was published by Kōkōdō 浩々洞, a religious fellowship consisting of people living together at Kiyozawa's residence at Hongō in Tokyo. In the first issue, he called upon the Japanese youth to develop their mental capacities through introspection, saying, "Come, all of you who wish to exit the valley of suffering and sorrow, and sport in the plains of peace and joy! Light is eternally here." As to what he meant by the development of mental capacities, Kiyozawa explains:

Spiritual Activism does not take non-religious teachings as its norm; it takes the Buddhist teachings as its norm. It does not focus its attention on objective forms but emphasizes the subjective mental ground instead. At times, it is called the way of introspection and at other times, Spiritual Activism.²¹

From another angle, this means that "one should put introspection first, and then be concerned with external things (gaikan-shugi 外観主義)." By establishing introspective self-awareness, that is to say, by "awakening to the original nature of the self (hon-i honbun 本位本分)," we can escape for the first time from the world of delusion and perceive the realm of liberation. In this sense, it is possible to say that Spiritual Activism is none other than the way of introspection. On November 3, 1901, Kiyozawa began a series of lectures entitled "Lectures on Spiritual Activism" at the Kōkōdō. Attended by twenty students, both male and female, the title of his first talk was "Naikan jikaku no hitsuyō 内観自覚の必要 (The Need for Introspective Awareness)." This shows that introspection was strongly emphasized in Spiritual Activism.

¹⁹ Futaba, Fukushima and Akamatsu eds. 1978, vol. 1, p. 248.

²⁰ KMZ (Hozokan edition), vol. 8, p. 304.

²¹ "Seishin-shugi no. 2," KMZ, vol. 6, p. 297.

²² "Mazu subekaraku naikan subeshi 先ず須らく内観すべし (You Should First Undertake Introspection)," KMZ, vol. 6, pp. 60-61.

²³ KMZ (Hozokan edition), vol. 8, pp. 272 and 330.

IV. From Introspection and Self-Reflection to Other Power Faith

Introspection means to turn our attention, which is constantly focused on outward things, inward and to focus on the self itself. Kiyozawa admits, "Since I generally focus my attention on things and events outside myself, I seldom find myself engaged in introspection."²⁴ Physiologically speaking, we humans do not have the capacity for looking within ourselves, but Buddhism teaches us to discern the truth by looking into our minds. As the *Maka shikan* 摩訶止観 (Great Cessation and Contemplation), a meditation manual of the Tendai sect, states, "It is through introspection that we attain this wisdom."²⁵ Kiyozawa placed great emphasis on the Buddhist tradition of meditation.

From Yūgen mugen roku 有限無限録 (Records of the Finite and the Infinite), a series of short essays on philosophical and religious topics that Kiyozawa jotted down in a notebook between 1899 to 1900, we can see that he made "everyday shikan meditation" the core of his program of self-cultivation. According to this work, whenever he found himself assailed by distress and anxiety, Kiyozawa reproached himself by saying, "This is because I have been negligent in practicing shikan meditation. I should work harder on self-cultivation," or "This is because I have been negligent in self-cultivation. I should practice shikan meditation constantly." In Pure Land Buddhism, meditation is generally rejected as a self-power practice. Therefore, doesn't Kiyozawa's practice of meditation contradict the Other Power teaching of Shin Buddhism?²⁷

It is well known that "meditation" holds an important place in the tradition of Pure Land Buddhism. For example, it is an important topic in the *Sutra on the Meditation on Amida Buddha*, one of the three major Pure Land texts. In it, Vaidehī, one of the central figures of this sutra, beseeches Śākyamuni Buddha, "May the World-honored One teach me how to concentrate my

²⁴ KMZ, vol. 2, p. 188.

²⁵ T 46, 54c.

²⁶ Shikan 止観, literally meaning "cessation and contemplation," is a form of meditation practiced in the Tendai sect, in which the practitioner first settles the mind in order to cease all obstructing mental activities, and then contemplates Reality.

²⁷ This has always been a major problem in Shin Buddhism. For example, Ko Samyong 高 史明, a popular Shin Buddhist lecturer and lay practitioner, has recently argued (in Ko 2001, p. 9.) as follows: "Some people may say, 'Introspection is the essence of Shin Buddhism.' However, did Shinran ever speak about introspection? . . . If we are to talk about the essence of Shin Buddhism, introspection isn't its essence. We should say the essence of Shin Buddhism is the Nembutsu."

thoughts and teach me genuine acceptance." In response, Śākyamuni smiles and teaches Vaidehī how to meditate on the features of the Pure Land as well as on the various categories of people who can attain birth there. Shan-tao 善導 (613–681), the Chinese Pure Land monk who produced a commentary on this sutra, states, "'Concentrate my thoughts' refers to the preliminary practices before undertaking meditation." Based on this interpretation, Shinran explains, "'Teach me how to concentrate my thoughts' refers to preliminary practices. 'Teach me genuine acceptance' refers to the adamantine true mind (i.e., faith)." As this shows, the phrase "concentrate my thoughts" is closely tied to Other Power faith.

Kiyozawa saw introspection, or *shikan* meditation, as being interconnected with such faith. In his view, both the *Āgamas*, which teach the way to enlightenment through introspection, and the *Discourses* of Epictetus, which emphasizes self-reflection, are guides pointing to the way to attain Other Power faith as expounded in the *Tannishō*. After Kiyozawa contracted tuberculosis in 1894 and began to cough up blood repeatedly, he undertook what he called "the contemplation on death (*shisōkan* 死想観)," ³¹ resolutely examining its approach moment by moment. However, it was due to the very fact that he was constantly aware of his own mortality that he was able to realize Other Power faith and discover the joy of liberation from birth-and-death. He stated:

Hence, for me to be able to perceive to some extent the sublime world of liberation while still alive, I must be confronted by the state of mind expressed by the phrase "poised at the extremity where life turns to death, the great death (where one casts aside all attachments) is of utmost importance." This is what is meant by the words, "brooding over my death, I find joy in faith." 32

"To perceive the sublime world of liberation" in the midst of everyday life corresponds to the state of joy, which Shinran described as follows: "Joy is to rejoice beforehand at being assured of attaining what one shall attain." The sublime world of liberation experienced while alive, then, refers to the

²⁸ T 12, 341b-c.

²⁹ T 37, 258c.

³⁰ CWS, vol. 1, p. 213, slightly amended.

³¹ *Tōyō nikki*, entry for March 26, 1902. KMZ, vol. 8, p. 439.

³² "Shinrei no shūyō," KMZ, vol. 7, p. 256.

³³ This passage is from *Ichinen tanen mon'i* 一念多念文意 (Notes on Once-Calling and Many-Calling). See CWS, vol. 1, p. 480.

world opened up when one attains a state of non-retrogression from birth in the Pure Land (also known as the state of the truly settled, *shōjōju* 正定聚) as one of the so-called benefits of faith.

In his book, *Kiyozawa Manshi Sensei* 清沢満之先生 (My Teacher Kiyozawa Manshi), Nishimura Kengyō points out that the early development of Kiyozawa's Spiritual Activism was somewhat different from what it became later on. In the former, Kiyozawa stressed introspection and self-reflection, while in the latter, he declared unequivocally that "I believe in Other Power." This difference in emphasis, Nishimura suggests, can be found between *Yūgen mugen roku* and *Rōsenki.*³⁴ According to Wakimoto Tsuneya, such keen insight comes from Nishimura's profound devotion to Kiyozawa. The reason why Kiyozawa's last published work, a short essay entitled "Waga shinnen 我信念 (My Faith)" was hailed as "the *Tannishō* of the Meiji period," was because it eloquently expressed Kiyozawa's unalloyed joy that comes from faith. In that essay, neither the word "introspection" nor "self-reflection" is found. Yet, it does not mean that the two are unnecessary. On the contrary, Kiyozawa's quest shows that introspection and self-reflection are both crucial in attaining the joyful acceptance of Other Power faith.

(Translated by Robert F. Rhodes)

³⁴ Nishimura 1951, pp. 309–311.

³⁵ Wakimoto 1982, p. 187.

ABBREVIATIONS

- CWS The Collected Works of Shinran. Hirota, Dennis, et. al., trans. 2 vols. Kyoto: Jōdo Shinshū Hongwanji-ha 浄土真宗本願寺派, 1997.
- KMZ Kiyozawa Manshi Zenshū 清沢満之全集 (The Collected Works of Kiyozawa Manshi). Ōtani Daigaku 大谷大学 ed. 9 vols. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten 岩波書店, 2002-03.

KMZ (Hozokan edition)

Kiyozawa Manshi Zenshū 清沢満之全集 (The Collected Works of Kiyozawa Manshi). Akegarasu Haya 曉鳥敏 and Nishimura Kengyō 西村見曉 eds. 8 vols. Kyoto: Hōzōkan 法蔵館, 1953–57.

REFERENCES

- Futaba Kenkō 二葉憲香, Fukushima Kanryū 福嶋寬隆 and Akamatsu Tesshin 赤松轍真 ed. 1978. Shin Bukkyō ronsetsushū「新仏教」論說集 (A Collection of Articles from Shin Bukkyō), 4 vols., Kyoto: Nagata Bunshōdō 永田文昌堂.
- Ko, Samyong 高史明. 2001. "Zaiaku jinjū bonnō shijō 罪悪深重煩悩熾盛 (Deep and Heavy Karmic Evil and Raging Blind Passions)", in *Shindō Kōza* 信道講座 (Lectures on the Path of Faith), vol. 63 (July, 2001).
- Nishimura Kengyō 西村見暁. 1951. Kiyozawa Manshi sensei 清沢満之先生 (My Teacher Kiyozawa Manshi) Kyoto: Hōzōkan.
- Tada Kanae 多田鼎. 1991. "Kiyozawa Manshi no shōgai to chi'i 清沢満之の生涯と地位" (The Life and Position of Kiyozawa Manshi)" in Fukushima Kanryū 福嶋寛隆 and Akamatsu Tesshin 赤松轍真 ed., *Shiryō Kiyozawa Manshi* 資料清沢満之 (Resources for the Study of Kiyozawa Manshi). Shiryō-hen. Kyoto: Dōbōsha 同朋舎.
- Wakimoto Tsuneya 脇本平也. 1982. *Hyōden Kiyozawa Manshi* 評伝清沢満之 (A Critical Biography of Kiyozawa Manshi), Kyoto: Hōzōkan.