## NAGARJUNA'S MAHAYANAVIMSAKA

## Prefatory Notes

The Madhyamika philosophy of Buddhism goes in China under the name of the San-lun school ( $\equiv_{nm}$ ), which literally means the school of the three treatises, which are Nāgārjuna's Madhyamika-sāstra, Dvadasadvāra-sāstra, and Āryadeva's Sataka. In Tibet there is a Buddhist school known as the Prasaṅgīkā which claims to transmit the tradition of the Madhyamika philosophy as was expounded by such later followers of Nāgārjuna as Buddhapalita and Candrakīrti. The Prasaṅgīkā school has five treatises by Nāgārjuna for its doctrinal authority. They are known as "rigspahi tshogs sde" (Division of Norm-collection) and consist of (1) Mulamadhyamika, (2) Yuktishashtika (3) Sūnyatāsaptatī, (4) Vigrahavyāvartanī, and (5) Vaidalya.

While it goes without saying that the fundamental ideas of the two schools, Chinese San-lun and the Tibetan Prasangîka, are derived from Nagarjuna's original treatise (Kārikā) on the Madhyamika, we can distinguish the three different undercurrents of thought in the text-books of the Madhyamika school. (1) Of the five Tibetan works, the Vigrahavyāvartanī and the Vaidalya may be regarded as forming the logical wing of the school, as its central subject is a critical study of the Nyaya; (2) The Sunyatasaptati has for its content a subject-matter somewhat different from the other texts, but as it is on the whole a summary of the Mulamadhyamika, it forms another branch of thought together with the Mūlamadhyamika and the Dvadasadvara-sastra, which last is again a compendium of the Sunyatāsaptatī and the Mulamadhyamika; and lastly, (3) The Yuktishashtika differs not only in its subject-matter but in its tendency of thought from the rest of the Madhyamika works, and what we especially notice in this book is that it betrays an idealistic way of thinking. This is shown in the following extracts:

|| hbyun-ba che la-sogs bsad-pa || rnam-par ses-su yan-dagqdu || de ses-pas-ni hbral hgyur-na || log-par rnam-brtag ma-yin nam ||

(Verse 34)

"What are known as the elements, etc., are included in Vijnana (consciousness): knowing this; would one think of the elements as separate from Vijnana? The elements so regarded are the result of wrong discrimination."

And again in Verses 36 and 77, we have this: "This world is said to be conditioned by ignorance; when ignorance vanishes, the world too vanishes. Being so, the world is no more than discrimination."

In the Mahayanavimsaka whose Tibetan texts along with the Chinese version are given below, this idealsitic tendency is more pronounced than in the Yuktishashtika. There is no doubt that the philosophy of the Prajnā-pāramitā Sutra and the theory of Sunyata as advocated by Nagarjuna are derived from the phenomenalism of the Buddhist teaching that things  $(bh\bar{a}v\bar{a}h)$  have no reality of their own because of the law of conditionality. Thus naturally Nagarjuna is ever intent everywhere in his philosophical treatises to dwell upon the ten similes in the Prajnā-pāramitā Sutra illustrative of the theory of Sunyata (emptiness), saying that all things are like dreams, visions, the moon reflected in water, and images in the mirror. The reason, however, why we see all these actualities before us in spite of Nagarjuna's phenomenalistic interpretation of existence, is according to him, due to our ignorance which stirs up our minds to create all these dream-like existences. This absolute idealism or subjectivism which denies the reality of an external world in itself, logically leads to the Vijnanavada point of view as held by Asanga and Vasubandhu. According to this teaching. Viinana alone exists  $(vij\bar{n}\bar{a}naptim\bar{a}tra)$ , no reality is granted to external objects (artha), and even mind  $(citta \text{ or } vij\bar{n}\bar{a}na)$  as one of such objects cannot claim any reality: in brief, apart from the comprehended  $(gr\bar{a}hya)$  there is no comprehending subject  $(gr\bar{a}-haka)$  either.

While the philosophy of Nāgārjuna is based upon the theory of Sunyata as expounded in his encyclopedic commentary to the *Prajnā-pāramitā Sūtra*, it is also supported by the Avatamsaka doctrine, the final word of which is that "the triple world is mind only"; and indeed his treatise on the ten stages (dasabhūmi) of Bodhisattvahood is no more than the confirmation of this psychological dictum. In this respect the *Mahāyānavimsaka* is quite explicit as we see in verses 6, 8–12, 17–20, 22, etc., especially in verse 10 which corresponds to the utterance of Nyorairin (如來林) Bodhisattva at the Yamadeva's Palace as described in the *Avatamsaka*:

"Mind is like an artist

Variously producing the five skandhas."

The verse 17 begins with the following:

Mdo-las|kye rgyal-bahi srar-dag hdi-lta ste|khams gsumpa hdi-ni sems-tsam-mo shes hbyan-bahi phyir-ro|

"As we read in the Sutra, O sons of the Buddha, in the triple world there exists mind only."

This is in full agreement with the idea of the *Vimsika-vritti*, where we have this:

Bya byed rmi-ram gnod-pa hdra. 如夢害作事. (It is as if in dream evil deeds are actually committed.)

And again the verse 16 reads:

(Our knowledge of reality is like a dream in which things appear as if real, but there are no objective realities in dreams, and in like manner how can we prove the reality of an objective world?)

We may add that the various currents of thought to be discerned in Nagarjuna's works above referred to including the Mahāyānavimsaka are traceable in his stupendous commentary on the Mahāprajnā-pāramitā-sūtra. In the fifteenth volume, Nāgārjuna comments, "If all existences (bhāvāh) are real, it is impossible for mind to know them. If they exist because of their being known by mind, this is not to be called as existing." In Volume Eight we have: "All existences are like a plantain-tree; all is created by mind. But when you know that things have no reality, the mind itself ceases to exist." Nāgārjuna's comments on the ten similarities explaining the theory of Sūnyatā also testify to the idealistic tendency of his philosophy.

While lately making comparative study of the philosophical verses of Nagarjuna, which are preserved in the Tibetan and the Chinese Tripitaka, I came across two versions of his Mahāyānavimsaka in the mdo hgrel, of the bstan hgyur, which in Cordier's Catalogue correspond to No. 17 (Tsa), 156a, 4-157 a, 5; and No. 33 (Gi), 211 b, 8-213 a. In the Chinese Tripitaka there is just one version of this work (Nanjo, No. 1308). In the following pages all these three versions are given for comparison. The Chinese consists of three parts: the prefatory verse, the text proper, and the dedicatory: the Tibetan (Tsa) contains 23 verses as the Chinese, but each division retains the same gatha form. Towards the end of the text the Tibetan version grows disorderly and does not conform to the Chinese order; in this latter respect however the Tibetan (Gi) version consisting of twenty verses is in better agreement with the Chinese. In the following edition of the Mahayānavimsaka, the "Tsa" text has been used as the principal one for comparison. As I have so far no access to other Tibetan editions than the Red Peking edition brought over here by Professor Yenga Teramoto, there are some points in each of the three texts, Tibetan and Chinese, which require further elucidation. It is my earnest wish that scholars would help us to clear up all the difficulties I have left here unsettled. An English translation and notes giving reasons for various readings and corrections will appear in the next issue of *The Eastern Buddhist*.

Susumu Yamaguchi

## 

- (व) ट्रेगूर्अक्ट्रबा.वर्षिश.ज.सैबा.पंक्षज.सू ।। (व) ट्रेगूर्अक्ट्रबा.वर्षिश.ज.सैबा.पंक्षज.सू ।।
- |পর্ব .বর্স.সু.রিব.রিবা.বঞ্জ.লূ। |রিএর.కুর.ফীজ.বম.র্ব..রীম.বা |ছূই.নুই.ব্ছুই.বম.বী.ব.সুধ| (ঽ.ফ)|ছেবার.সুই.রিএর.রি.জুই.রাংর.ফীরা|
  - [अहा . स्वा शा चहित . ता से चा ता से च
  - (i) 歸命不可思議性 諸佛無著眞實智 諸法非言非無言 佛悲愍故善宣說
- | বিষয় বিষ

- । श्रेमश्रक्ष द्वास्य स्थान्य स्थान्य
  - (2) 第一義無生 隨轉而無性 佛衆生一相 如虚空平等
- |गुरु-सम्बेर-प्र-मेश-सुंह-पुत्र-प्रमा |दे-चलेर-पुरुश-पुरुश-सदिर-सद्द-भद्द-। |द-द्वेर-पुरुश-पुरुश-सदिर-सद्द-सद्द-। (४.३) |स-द्वज्ञ-पुरुश-प
  - | নিধ্যমন্ত্রি, দ্বার্থ স্থিত নিধ্যমন্ত্র।
    | নিধ্যমন্ত্রি, দ্বার্থ স্থিত নিধ্যমন্ত্রী বা প্রমান্তর বা বিশ্ব স্থা স্থা বিশ্ব স্থা স্থা বিশ্ব স্থা বিশ্ব স্থা স্থা বিশ্ব স্থা বিশ
    - (3) 此彼岸無生 自性緣所生 彼諸行皆空 一切智智行
- (४.4) र्ट्स्स.स्.मी४.मी.४४.५५ । माञ्चेत्रस्य १४४.८४.५५.४५ । माञ्चेत्रस्य १४५.५५.५५ । माञ्चेत्रस्य १५५५.५५ । माञ्चेत्रस्य १५५५, १५५५ । माञ्चेत्रस्य १५५ । माञ्चेत्रस्य १५५ । माञ्चेत्रस्य १५५ । माञ्चेत्रस्य १५५ । १५५ । १५५ । १५५ । १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५५ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १५६ | १६

- (मी. 4) | द्रिश्चार्या समस्य उद्दार प्रस्ति । विश्वास । विश्वास
  - (4) 無染真如性 無二等寂靜 諸法性自性 如影像無異
- (इ. २) | तर्त्वः रंटः तर्त्वः श्रुचः स्वानः स्वानः
  - (मैं 5) |स्सिदे हैं। वर्षा कर्षा वर्षा कर्षा करा करिया करिय
    - (5) 凡夫分別心 無實我計我 故起諸煩惱 及苦樂捨等
- 1ट्टे.ट्चा.लेज.इशह.३शह.इंट्टा १ट्टीज.चर.ईचा.चर्हेज.कुर्य.ट्टा १शह.टुहासकूचा.ट्टाच्ट्टा.इंटा १८० ।टिच्.च.टुचाह्यहेचा.टिच्टा.ट्टा

- | जिताह कुट क्रायक्षणकार पर ... | | प्रश्चिम पर क्षिण प्रकृत क्षेत्र क्षेत्र प्र प्र । | प्रदेश प्रस्ति पर सक्ष्य कुट प्र प्र । | प्रिकार पर प्रस्ति क्षेत्र क्षेत्र क्षेत्र है जा प्र । ।
  - (7) 天趣勝妙樂 地獄極大苦 皆不實境界 六趣常輪轉
- | यबर.स्.क्षेट्र.टे.ट्रश्त.सुर्ग | ट्वी.चड्र.तम्ब.श्रम्ब.क्षेट्र.क्वेश.क्ट्रा | ट्वी.चड्र.तम्ब.श्रम्ब.क्ट्रा.क्वे | ट्वाट्र.यं.श्रम्ब.च्वेट्र.स्.सुर्ग (द्
  - - (6) 世間老病死 為苦不可愛 隨諸業墜墮 此實無有樂

- <sup>(8)</sup> 衆生妄分別 煩惱火燒燃 墮地獄等趣 如野火燒林
- 13.264.2.2.2.254.48.8c.1 13.264.8988.24.60.0.521 13.264.8988.24.60.0.521 (4.0) 19.25.6.5.6.5.221
  - (9) 衆生本如幻 復取幻境界 履幻所成道 不了從緣生
- । शु. भायका उत्तर पर दे में खेरे हो। । दे त्येश स्ट छेर स्योग सासेश सासेश । वर्षिर स्थित हो स्थापन स्थित मो से या सासेश (इ. 10) । हु . से र जु. शु. भायन सी साम से या साम

  - (10) 如世間畫師 畫作夜叉相 自畵已自怖 此名無智者
- विशासायवार खेवा चेट च स्था । (इ. ग्रा बिट केट स्टाचीशायर शामिशासश

। इ.स.चेर.ह्य.स.ट्र.प्रस.चेट.स्स। । इ.स.चेर.ह्य.स.ट्र.प्रस.चेट.सस।

四 衆生自起染 造彼輪廻因 造已怖墜墮 無智不解脫

(इ. 15) टिट्बाजुट-ट्टबातूर-डि.च.लुंबा ।लिज्ञ-टट-जुबादा-ट्टबातूर-डि.च.लुंबा ।केश-तर-ट्रेबादा-ट्रेग-डी ।केश-तर-ट्रेबादा-ट्रेग-डी

> । श्रेमः प्रते : द्वाः वीदाः प्रदे : यः प्रदे । । श्रमः प्रते दे के प्रत्यः क्षिणः विद्वाः प्रदे । । श्रमः प्रते : के प्रत्याः क्षिणः प्रदे । । श्रमः प्रते : द्वाः वीदाः प्रदे : यः प्रदे । । श्रमः प्रते : द्वाः वीदाः प्रदे : यः प्रदे ।

(12) 衆生虚妄心 起疑惑垢染 無性計有性 受苦中極苦

चित्रास्य श्रीस हेत्रे. भूते. ग्रीशनी (इ. म्उ) डि.स्पा श्रीस स्थान श्रीस स्थान |ह्रियस्त्रस्यः स्टब्स्यः तः स्ट्रिसः यसः प्री।

- [ह्रमश.स्ट्र.चेट.क्च.ल.श्रूच.शहरी |श्रद्ध.चेश.स्व.शहर.शुशश.क्च.इशश |श्रद्ध.चेश.स्व.शहर.वश.वृ। (मु. ग) ।श्रद्ध.यस.श्रद.टे.टेच.शहर.वश.वृ।
- (13) 佛見彼無救 乃起悲愍意 故發菩提心 廣修菩提行
- | श्रद्धान्ते सार् दे ते प्रहेन हे ते पहेन । हिं न प्रहेन पर के स्वापक में प्रहेन । हिं न प्रहेन पर के स्वापक में प्रहेन । हिंदा के स्वापक मे स्वापक में प्रहेन । हिंदा के स्वापक में प्रहेन । हिंदा के स्वापक में प्रहेन । हिंदा के स्वापक में प्रहान । हिंदा के स्वापक में स्वापक में स्वापक में स्वापक में स्वापक में स्वापक में स्वापक मे
  - (मि 12) | ने प्राप्त स्थान स्
    - (\*\*) 得無上智果 即觀察世間 分別所纏縛 故為作利益
  - |चार.मुझ.लर.रचा.रूच.र्.चाञ्चचाह्य। (इ. १२) |इ.ज्रेस.स्चे.इट.पर्यंज.पर्वंट.च।

| मुन्त्रभार्यो,यार्क्ट्रास्य भाष्ट्रिया

- । दुर्से. य. क्टूट. त. केट. टे. अहूट. । । टु. यंत्र. हुत्ता. भवंत्र. मंद्रा स्था । । हु. यंत्रे हुत्ता. भवंत्र. मुंद्रा संक्षा । (मू. 13) । लंद. ट्यांट्र्य, यु. अहूं र. यंद्रे. हुटा।
- (15) 從生及生已 悉示正真義 後觀世間空 離初中後際
- [ह्या.स.रेचीस.सहतु.रट.चडुर.यसमा 18.टर.परस.तत्त.इस.त.स्रेर १९.ए) हि.डेर.भहट.यस.प्रियः च.टरा
  - - (16) 觀生死涅槃 是二俱無我 無染亦無壞 本清淨常寂
- (द. 12) क्रि.जम.३भन.वी.सी.सी.त.च.चुरी

|द्विम्स्य स्थितः सामित्र स्थान्।

- विष्ट्रायः अस्ति । या विष्ट्रायः अस्ति । विष्ट्रायः । विष्र्रायः । विष्ट्रायः । विष्ट्रायः । विष्ट्रायः । विष्ट्रायः । विष्
- (17) 夢中諸境界 覺已悉無見 智者寤癡睡 亦不見生死
- । বু.ডু.ছুর্মরার্থ্রমান্যর্থ্র এই দুর্ । এই শেষ্ট্র দেই শ্বরমান্তর্থ এই দুর্থ । বু.জু. সরার্থ্রমান্যর্থী সমান্তর্থ এই দুর্থ বু.জে । জু.সরার্থ্রমান্যর্থী সমান্তর্থ এই দুর্থ
  - (23) 於彼諸法法性中 實求少法不可得 如世幻師作幻事 智者應當如是知
  - [평,전도,건최근,고,법영학,건,왕]
    (由, 18) [건강,근本,超智학,오건왕이 [남, 성학,건문, 학생학, 학학, 학학학 [라, 성학, 건문, 학학학 학학 [라, 성학, 건문, 학학학 학학 학학 [라, 성학, 건문, 학학학 학학 [라, 성학 [라, 성

ारे.जहा.स्वी.स्ट.श्र.स्वी.जहा

- (20) 此一切唯心 安立幻化相 作善不善業 感善不善生
- । देश व. क्रस. केर. व चार्य र त्या वा स. त्या । देश वे स्था समाय उर्ज प्रताना स. केरा । देश व. क्रस. केर. व चार्य स. त्या वा स. त्या
  - - (21) 若滅於心輪 即滅一切法 是諸法無我 法諸悉清淨

। होर. तर्र. में . सष्ट्र. रर्र. रर्वे - ट्रा । क्यां श्राह्म - संबंद. तथा नहीं यहा त. हो।

- ाउँदी-द्रमा-मानुका-गान-द्रमाकाक्ष-भिता ।द्रमा-देत-द्रमका-गुका-क्षे-पन-प्रदेशका। ।द्रमा-देत-द्रमका-गुका-क्षे-पन-प्रदेशका। (मी. 17) ।क्षि-प-र-ए-क्षे-प्रमान-प्रदेशका
  - (18) 愚癡闇蔽者 墜墮生死海 無生計冇生 起世間分別
  - (19) 若分別有生 衆生不如理 於生死法中 起常樂我想
- [नार नोश्वास्त्र स्थान्य स्था [स्रेन्स सदे कु सक्ते के स्था [स्रेन्स सदे कु सक्ते के स्था [स्रोन्स सदे कु सक्ते के स्था [स्राप्त स्थान स्था
  - |य्राय्यः सन्धः स्वाः स
  - (24) 生死輪廻大海中 衆生煩惱水充滿 若不運載以大乘 畢竟何能到彼岸

- । छु. खुबो.लब. चु. ट्यीट. चर. ट्यीर। । इस. तर. हुबो. त. ट्यू. ट्या. चु। । लट. ट्या. ट्यू. ची. स्वेर. संदे. स्वेर। (द. 53) । स. प्रचा. मुचेर. मीश. यीटा च. ट्यू।
  - (22) 佛廣宣說世間法 當知即是無明緣 若能不起分別心 一切衆生何所生
- भद् र.नार्ह्स् चाराकुरान्त्रः है.ची.नाः ह्यूच. रात्त्रं यी. श्रीच. प्राच्या श्रीच. प्राच्या श्रीच. विभावा स्था

र्ट्र-ग्रेश-वश्चि-॥ ।वि.चर-बी.शिवर-स्.व्र-ट्र-जी.श्चर-रेट-टेनु-श्चॅर-प्री-जी.

सह र प्राह्म नहार् ।। भह्म प्राप्त के प्राह्म नहार हैं।

। या केते यह १५ । ख्रा ५५ १५ १६ व्या ५ के हिंदा माना स

大乘二十頌論 大龍樹造 宋天竺三藏施護譯 (至元法寶勘同總錄 第九)